CEC3 Business & Calendar Meeting  
Wednesday, April 18, 2018  
6:30 PM  
P.S. 76, 220 W. 121 St. – Auditorium

Business Minutes  
(Approved at the May 16, 2018 CEC3 Business Meeting by all Council members present)

❖ Call to Order 6:43p
❖ Roll Call of Members  Kristen Berger, Inyanga Collins, Daniel Katz, Lucas Liu, Mike McCarthy, Genisha Metcalf, Jean Moreland  
Late: Manuel Casanova, Dennis Morgan, Kim Watkins  
The meeting was chaired by Kristen Berger, 1st VP  
DOE Staff: Ilene Altschul, D3 Superintendent; DJ Sheppard, Family Leadership Coordinator
❖ Approval of Minutes  
1. March 8, 2018 Business Meeting Minutes were approved by all Council members present.
❖ Old Business –  
1. Thank you to everyone who made the Harlem Schools Summit such a success: Excellence and Equity Committee Co-Chairs Genisha Metcalf and Dennis Morgan who put the event together, hosts P.S. 180, CSD3 staff DJ Sheppard and Tracy McClaire and those Council members who were present.
❖ New Business ~ none
❖ Adjournment 6:44p
Call to Order 6:44p

Roll Call of Members Kristen Berger, Inyanga Collins, Daniel Katz, Lucas Liu, Mike McCarthy, Genisha Metcalf, Jean Moreland, Jane Sun
Late: Manuel Casanova, Dennis Morgan, Kim Watkins 7p
K Berger, 1st VP, chaired the calendar meeting until the arrival of Pres. Watkins

DOE Staff: Ilene Altschul, D3 Superintendent, DJ Sheppard, D3 Family Leadership Coordinator

President’s Report ~ deferred

Superintendent’s Report

- Harlem Summit was very informative. - thank you to CEC, Genisha and Dennis for their hard work
- Chancellor Carranza- Manhattan Town Hall will be on April 27th – CEC will be receiving an invite to the parent forum from FACE. Student (4) and DOE employee event is also being planned.
- Kindergarten offers went out. A few schools have waitlists. Every school with a waitlist, a family was offered an overflow site in the interim. Schools with waitlists are
  PS 9 – 25
  PS 87 – 33, but it has gone down from where it started
  PS 199 – 20
  The numbers are lower than they have been previously and schools will continue to work through the waitlists. G n T offers have not gone out yet and that will open seats across the district.
  - Council: Were the same schools waitlisted last year? Supt. Altschul: 191 has a waitlist of 2 students but we are not sure why, possibly because they are late applicants. I have reached out but have not gotten a response yet. These are the numbers based on who gave offers.
  - School survey period has been extended, it now closes on April 20th. Please remind parents to fill out because it impacts the schools’ quality report.
  - ESSA training for SLTs on writing their schools comprehensive educational plan –changed to May 8th at 5:00 p.m. at PS 145
  - State ELA Testing last week. The day was quite long so I commend to parents and students who had amazing stamina.
  - My Brother’s Keeper forum was hosted by MBP Gale Brewer on Monday. Superintendent District 4 was integral in planning the event.
  - Middle school matches/offers went out
  - CEC had requested data regarding enrollment at PS191 and 145 (on file) looking at whether enrollment has gone up and if there has been a shift in diversity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PS 145</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>370</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Their poverty/economic need index went up, from 80 to 84%.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Their poverty/economic index went from 69% to 71%

- CEC requested Middle School data - will not be available until the summer:
- Supt. Altschul reached out to Central but the data must come from the PTA reports.
- Middle school admissions- She is working with the Office of Enrollment- the email went out. Still requesting feedback

**Presentation**

1. **Know Your Educational Rights: Students' Resource-Related Rights Under New York State Law / Center for Educational Equity at Teachers College, Columbia University – Tiffany Ferrette, Paulina Sosa and Paul Rogers, Jr.**
   - The Center for Educational Equity champions the rights of all children, particularly children in poverty and children of color, to meaningful educational opportunities. They looked at changes overtime from 1960 to present.
   - Students' Constitutional Rights – The Campaign for Fiscal Equity vs. State of New York, the NY Court of Appeals decision requires the state to provide all students
     1. Sound Basic Education
     2. The opportunity to meet New York State Learning Standards – if you have students who are not meeting state learning standards, it is a violation of their state constitutional rights for them not to receive the additional supports. State Law required additional academic intervention services.
     - Supt. Altschul: The school has to provide academic intervention services. The school is funded for academic intervention for the students that are not meeting standards, that are below grade level and they are to be providing supports before school, during school or after school.
     3. Adequate preparation for civic participation and good jobs
   - Resources Required:
     1. Qualified teachers, principals and other personnel
     2. Suitable, up-to-date curricula (including more supports for students struggling academically).
     3. Appropriate resources for students with disabilities and English language learners.
     4. Class size and instructional groupings.
     5. Instrumentalities of learning
     6. Safe and orderly environment
     7. Adequate and accessible facilities.
   - For more essential resources download is available: [www.centerforeducationalequity.org](http://www.centerforeducationalequity.org)

**Public Comment**

- Mark Diller, CB7: A lot of schools use cluster teachers to fill that role (of library media specialist) who may or may not have that as their principal focus.
  - Paul Rogers, Jr: Middle and High School are required by state law to have a librarian but it is not required for elementary schools. Does Wadleigh have any resource issues worth noting?
  - Gigs Taylor-Stephenson, PTA President, Wadleigh: The librarian retired and then decided to come back and was told we did not have the resources, no tech person and science labs
(Pres. Watkins arrived and chaired from this point on)

**Old Business**

1. **Middle School Admissions** – Middle School Committee Chair, K. Berger updated everyone on the fact that next year middle school admissions will go to a blind ranking system. The CEC3 Middle School Committee has been looking at the segregated middle schools in our district. Last year’s Middle School Symposium looked at the numbers and saw that we were deeply segregated and then the DOE came out with its diversity policy. What does it mean for our district? At the committee level we’ve been talking to parents about what they want but Superintendent Altschul and principals have been discussing it as well. The committee has had three meetings to discuss the proposals that have come from the superintendent and principals. We’ve been collecting questions and comments at D3feedback@gmail.com. Many of the questions, Superintendent Altschul will answer tonight. We are also joined by Matt Bergini from the DOE Office of Enrollment. We’ve specifically been asking to see a simulation of what it would look like if we put in academic “floors” for all of our middle schools: 10% of offers to level 1 students and 15% of offers to students scoring a level 2 on math state tests for each middle school. There is a middle school meeting at 6:30 at JOA and another on the 24th at 199 at 9a.

   - **Supt. Altschul:** A letter went out requesting feedback, emails that have been coming in have been from the same school. We are looking for a lot of different feedback.
   - **This idea has not been decided yet.** This is an idea and this is a real discussion. Our data is showing that we need to do something, we are not offering equity and excellence to all students and we really want to do something. We looked at the number of students that are level 1s and 2s across the district: 84% of level 1 and 2 students are Black and Latino.
   - **Our elementary schools are zoned and we know that where the communities are is the way our elementary schools are going to look. But we are Middle School Choice and people should have options regardless to what their test scores are.**
   - **There is a big disparity between our middle schools.** There are very high performing and very low performing middle schools and it’s not because the schools aren’t doing their jobs. The schools that have struggling students are doing well in offering their students a challenging curricula but they are working with a struggling population.
   - **What are the percentages of level 1s in D3?** Approximately 20% in level 1 and 30% fall in level 2, which is how we got to 10% and 15% “floors.” We want to make sure more students have access, 10% of offers have to be made to level 1 students and 15% of offers made to level 2s.
   - **Why are we doing another change?** With blind admissions there are going to be a lot of students applying to a lot of schools. A student that is high performing will have as much opportunity, they will not have to decide which one they are going to match to. The schools will not know who put them 1, 2, 3 or 4. The fear is that there will be even more disparity between schools, the concern is that they will take even more level 3s and 4s. Some schools are still keeping their screening rubric, like 54, others are re-evaluating and will create a different rubric from the current one. Families will have that information beforehand.
   - **At this time we are not planning on implementing floors for levels for 3s and 4s.**
   - **We expect our top rate match percentage will probably stay the same**
   - **Students are disproportionately affected by admissions process across our schools.** The intention is to make it more equitable.
   - **The appeals process will remain the same.**

   - **Marlon Lowe, Principal, Mott Hall II:**
     I believe ‘passionately’ this. I hope you have two things when you leave here, an understanding of decisions you’re going to make and its actual outcomes and, if you believe in equity and diversity an understanding of what that means consequentially for your scholar and what that means as a district 3 family.

     It starts with the choice process. MHIll was a big believer, as a first choice school, in choice. (In the past) twice, when they wanted to change the choice policy in the district, we were able to beat it back, twice. I’ve been sharply critical of Enrollment when they changed the choice process, I thought it was the wrong way forward.
Mott Hall II is the most diverse middle school in the district with one exception, English Language Learners. That did not happen coincidentally, it is a deliberate policy of a likeminded community that believed in diversity and accepted the consequences of that decision. People say, ‘I believe in diversity, but…’ When you interject that ‘but’ I question your genuine belief in diversity. If you’re now willing to put ‘skin’ in the game, you don’t actually believe in diversity. I am not here to criticize you for that, it is not about the good and bad binary of diversity.

At Mott Hall II we made you rank us first choice. If you did not, you were not considered. I thought it was fair and equitable, if you had very high test scores and you put us first choice, your chances of getting into our school were phenomenal. If you had high test scores and outcomes but wanted another community, got it, that allowed say you would not be considered at MHII. For those kids who wanted MHII first choice, it meant they had 1s, 2s or 3s. I was the principal of a school who, when many parents came up to me and said their child had gotten a level 1 or 2 when they were 9 or 10 years old, after a several hour test, would their child not be considered for MHII? I said, absolutely you would be considered if you put us first choice because not only would that guarantee you would be considered for admission but we would interview you, get to know your scholar and make a serious, focused decision based on many variables not just based on state test outcomes and what’s reported on the system. It is very difficult to distinguish between the scholars when using the system. They all look like great kids. If you use state test scores to drive outcomes, you are not going to have a diverse community. Where MHII put skin in the game is, if we only had low level 3s or 2s or 1s, that is populated out school and my staff and I were perfectly fine with that. Why would that be dissuading?

If we had 850 kids to consider, the only way to distinguish was state test scores and it created serious obstacles to diversifying my community. It meant we gave double 4s a back-up before we gave 1s, 2s, and 3s an option but we were getting the outcomes the city aspired to. But that got eliminated.

We have to adjust to the new reality. We had an honest dialogue with the Superintendent and my colleagues and I all walked out of the room with this understanding: 10% level 1s and 15% level 2s. We came together. This is better than choice, we get right down to it. I propose to you, if you’re asking me, are double 4s losing out? Yes, in a sense. If schools are ranking 1s and 2s, they (4s) may not get the school they all want to go to, it is going to force schools to level out and it gives more options to 1s, 2s and 3s who deserve a better option just because they had a bad day when they were 9 or 10 years old. It is an alternative to just doing nothing.

Do we stand by this as a proposal to address what we know is an inequity in our district that has gone on far too long? As you make this decision, please weigh the give and take and what has to happen to truly believe in diversity.

Mott Hall II will be growing, we have had to take in generally lower performing community and community has welcomed them with open arms. We are committed to doing the work to welcome them to our school because that is what diversity is all about.

Hopefully you can make the right decision that ensures equity throughout the district. Let’s do what we can. I respect your right to disagree with honestly and transparency. I am a fierce supporter of this proposal for that reason.

Charles DeBerry, Principal PS 76:
There’s a lot of talk about Harlem schools and happens north of 110th St. and what happens south. I’ve been in the district 15 years. I’ve seen a lot of attempts to do something about diversity across the district. We have an opportunity now to do something and these opportunities don’t come along often. The superintendent has really opened up the idea of looking at race and diversity. We’ve had several principal meetings where we’ve had this conversation, some of it uncomfortable. All of our colleagues agree that this is the way to go, we must do something at this point, we cannot put it off for another year. We have an opportunity to make a real difference, an opportunity to give our scholars an opportunity for all of the schools. We would like you to consider this as a strong possibility of moving in the direction of putting our district in the forefront of creating equity for all of our students.
Council Questions:

1. Given that 84% Black and Latino youth are 1s and 2s attend the Harlem schools, if we are not replacing them with 3s and 4s, there are potentially some enrollment issues for those Harlem schools. If we want to plan diversity, racial and academic, how do we get students into some of those highly sought after schools and how do we ensure that the schools that people consider undesirable are not even in a worse spot.

   Supt. Altschul: The data that we just shared showed that they are being replaced by levels 3 and 4s. e.g., PS180 would lose 4% of their 1s and 2s and gaining 2%. There are students coming. It’s not ideal. We want to make sure that families in Harlem have options. If families are opting to go to a different school, they should have that option.

   Councilmember: You are talking about a fraction of a kid! You are using percentages but if you look at the schools that use the state testing formula, the kids who are most struggling at 180, under the simulation, the kids testing at level 1s and 2s changes from 33 kids to 32 and the 2% gain is from 7 kids to 8 kids. When it comes to the schools that are currently serving the students who most struggle on these measures, there is barely any change at all. I’m not saying that the effort is not worth it. These simulated numbers are doing literally nothing to draw in a changed population for the majority of middle schools.

   Marlon Lowe, Principal, Mott Hall II: I would have fallen into that 84% in the school system. I needed a school that believed in me. You can enrich everyone. We seek out the level 1s and 2s. MHII has tremendous success in doing so. When the 10% and 15% number was stepped in, yes, it’s going to create some tension but it will have consequences on the district that is an excellent starting point. The beauty of this proposal is that it’s going to make MHII put more skin in the game. This number that was settled on was like a family coming to a consensus. We felt like these numbers were reasonable, it didn’t change the fabric of the school community or environment.

2. Can we make a plan that looks at the next 2, 4 and/or 6 years? How do we build it so that it looks at a larger change over a longer period of time?

   Supt. Altschul: I am in favor of that. I have no problem in thinking long term. Right now we are thinking in where to start, a first step. If there are thoughts or proposals people want to look at, we can investigate it as well. Families are very concerned. I acknowledge that. It is the change of an unknown, if you have a plan on what we can do, let’s discuss it. We can do this one and once we get the data we can revisit it too, I am open to that as well. I look to the community to give us those suggestions.

3. How are schools grappling with the changes?

   Marlon Lowe, MHII: A rubric would have to be created in response to what is decided but it forces you to look at their academic personal behaviors so you have grasp of who that scholar is. Schools have to look at the scholar. If the mechanism is clear, schools can adapt and figure out the best fit.

4. How do you ensure that a school that has to take more 1s and 2s isn’t also taking more 4s? Who is looking at it on a holistic level?

   Supt. Altschul: Our 4s are not going to the same school. They are most likely going to get their first choice.

   Marlon Lowe, Principal, MHII: For admissions, there are a subset of families that, who say, if the outcome is not favorable for what I want, I refuse. Your 1s and 2s, when they get that school they don’t want, they will attend that school with very little resistance, level 4s, refuse to go. The day after admissions comes out, the front door of MHII is bursting at the seams with families. The same for 199 or 87. The back door has allowed lack of diversity and diverted the leavening that should have happened. The system has an obligation to hold the line for all students.

5. Why is a 9 year old student judged on attendance? Can we include in a school’s rubric something that has attendance playing a lesser role?
- Supt. Altschul: We want students to maintain at least a 90% attendance record. A child should not be out more than 18 days. Lateness or excessive absence impacts their academic achievement. Students have to be in school to do well.
- Marlon Lowe, Principal, Mott Hall II: The main factor that leads to the outcome we get in our schools, is state test scores. Attendance is a fairer attribute to look at, there is an opportunity to reach out to families, but if we attack state test scores as the main entry point right now, let’s focus on state test scores.
- Member Berger: Different schools weigh attendance differently in their rubric. We need to do a better job to getting information out there, what our schools have and what they don’t have. We need to make sure that we are clear that people know more about all of the schools. The CEC3 Middle School webpage, www.cec3.org/middle-school-committee, has three links that are data portals to help share information. I strongly believe we need to support a diversity initiative now..

6. Pres. Watkins brought up the issue of the impact of charter schools on D3 students. There is an additional 300 5th grade students that are going to be added to our pool of 1200 students that are not included in these schematics. If a child attends a D3 charger school they are eligible for a D3 middle school which adds to the pool.
- Matt Broggini: The data is last year’s match and that information is included

7. Harlem Schools Summit, Genisha Metcalf and Dennis Morgan, Co-Chairs, reporting: Thank you to CEC3 for their support.
   - Highlights: We had 92 people, a combination of elected officials and community. Schools had an opportunity to showcase their schools and show the work they are doing. We had 5 of 6 schools represented. We created a Community Vision Board and we want to hear from families, community members and our corporate sponsors who gave their 2 cents in what they can do for our community. We focused on what we can do to strengthen the schools in our community? We are seeing families bus their children 2 miles, passed 10 schools that are under-enrolled, there is a problem of equity within our district. Creating anxiety in our families. If you believe in every school in your district, you don’t mind getting into one of those schools and that is what we focused on.
   - Linknyc was a partner for the summit and a representative did come out. They have a pilot program and would like to partner with D3 in taking advantage of their kiosks in putting your school information on them, i.e. school tours, school fundraiser. We are in a battle with charter schools, 11 of the 12 charter schools are above 110th St. and families have no idea what the public school across the street is about. That is one initiative we are looking at.
   - The Excellence and Equity Committee, working with Councilmember Perkins and the support of Sen. Benjamin for equity around funding that comes from both a city and state level. It is a way of providing equal access and equity to the community. We will be providing a report, when the data is in from our survey, on the state of equity in our community and how it’s impacted Harlem schools particularly.
   - Member Morgan: It’s not an equitable playing field. We did not have charter schools present at this year’s summit, we wanted to showcase D3 schools. We partnered with the principals and going forward hope to maintain that. Additionally there is a financial component we have been dealing with. There is a big disparity that shows that 19 of the top PTAs in the country are in NYC, 3 of them are in D3 – Anderson School, 199 and 87. The earning potential is so wide and we are looking for a way to find similar supports in the classroom. I hope that financially we can bridge that gap.
   - The third annual Harlem Summit date will be forthcoming.

 développé, public comment:
1. Karla Sutton, middle school teacher & parent: In favor of change; it is not enough but it is a start.
2. Nicole Greevy, D3 parent of 3rd grader: In support of change; diversity benefits everybody
3. Michele Stassfurth(?): In support of change. 1s and 2s need support, 4s will be fine.
4. Karyn Gooden: Believes in percentages for 1s and 2s but doesn’t want to equate 1s and 2s with racial diversity. Will there be extra funding for extra interviewing?
   - Supt. Altschul: The DOE doesn’t encourage interviewing, there is no funding attached to it. It’s too much work going into selection.
5. Yana Kalmyka, IntegratNYC: Would have loved to have been able to attend a school where my friend were respected as a diverse community.
6. Joe Riggio, PS199/Computer: It’s a first step. He is happy with the diversity at Mott Hall II. Why are state tests used as a measure? How are kids who are level 1 and 2 going to be able to handle the academics at Booker T.?
   - Supt. Altschul: It’s a standard metric. Schools have different measures as to what they consider a 4. It is not being used as a method for getting into a school, but because it’s a standard it puts everybody at the same level.
   - There will be academic intervention. They will receive the supports to those students as they need them and the MFSC will be ensuring they have the supports they need.
7. Helen Rosenthal, City Councilmember: It’s great that everyone came out tonight. Next time bring 3 more people. She appreciates what the DOE is doing to diversity schools.

❖ New Business
1. P.S. 185 Name Change to The Locke School of Arts and Engineering – Principal Jane Murphy, Principal P.S. 185, D3 Superintendent. Altschul
   - Principal Murphy, P.S. 185, has been at the school for 10 years: In the process of consolidating with PS208, they want to combine with the best of both schools. They envision a place where kids of color and kids from around Harlem will live and thrive together. They wanted to preserve the legacy of Alain L Locke, an African-American man who made significant contributions and they want to keep that legacy alive and that is why they chose the Locke School of Arts and Engineering. Both schools hold dear their arts program, 185 has dance and music and visual arts; 208 has a strong visual arts and engineering program, stewardship for the environment and we want to ensure it continues. Supt. Altschul concurred and asked for CEC3’s support and vote.

❖ Liaison Reports
1. P.S. 191 – The school is thriving with an active parent body, its first spring gala, a great deal of performing arts activity, Ms. Sheppard’s Reaching for the Arts program. On the enrollment side, they have a school size of 645 seats and they are projected to grow by another 100 students in the coming year taking their school from 516 to 616. Supt. Altschul interjected that they are not going to be able to maintain 5 preKs. They have 3 sections of kindergarten, a 2nd year of their GnT, 3 sections of 3rd grade, 3 sections of 4th grade. Their diversity numbers are teaming in a great way, their percentage of white students went up 4%, their percentage of Latino students remained the same, and the percentage of black students went down a little bit. Their percentage of economic need went down significantly. At 199, the percentage of economic need went up and at 452 shows equal promise. We are doing well transitioning through our 11 school rezoning.
2. Wadleigh – Wadleigh’s truncation is still on the docket for PEP to vote on next Wednesday. However we have met with elected officials in Harlem, with the NAACP and CB10 and our Council continuing to work on having that proposal removed from the docket and give Wadleigh the chance to succeed as a secondary school. Today, Wadleigh PTA President Gigs Taylor-Stephenson, and the Librarian, Paul McIntosh, met with the new Chancellor Carranza, and on-board him about what is truly going on at Wadleigh including the growth of the 6th grade entry, their recruiting strategy for the 6th grade entry point, their arts programming, the accountability of the academic performance metric that was shown to be the reason for the proposal. In addition I asked to attend a meeting with the Mayor and the Chancellor tomorrow and all the elected officials from the Harlem stakeholder group.

❖ Committee Reports
1. Multilingual, Lucas Liu, Chair, reporting: They met with Councilmember Trayger, Education Chair regarding Dual Language funding. They are looking to bring in more City Council members. All districts have City Councils and they will continue efforts to get support. They are looking for meeting city Councilmember Dromm.
They are working on an Italian Dual Language program at PS 242 and expanding the Chinese Dual Language program at 191. Families are interested if it is expanded. Russian Dual Language at 145 is changing diversity. He had a call with Cynthia Felix, who is pushing them to move faster to include on the 2020 list.

❖ Public Comment
1. Mark Diller, CB7, Co-Chair Youth, Education & Library Committee: There will be a 6:30p meeting at the district office with Dept. of Youth & Community Development who administer the grant money if you get a grant from someone like CM Rosenthal and help you navigate through the program.
   Thanks to Tracy McClaire at the Harlem Schools Summit who brought a library of DOE resources.
   Research shows that Diversity benefits all achievers, why would you oppose it?
   Whatever you can do to counter-balance it should be done.
2. Gigs Taylor-Stephenson, PTA President, Wadleigh: It was communicated to the parents that the school was told not to enroll students. Parents were encouraged by the Office of Enrollment center not to enroll in Wadleigh. Harlem is a diverse community, it’s the schools within the community. Let’s just fix the schools in the community.
   Has the district begun to formulate an action plan if the truncation is taken off the table?
   ▪ Supt. Altschul: I have begun working with Principals Fontanez and Afriye in looking what they would need in order to strengthen the school, they have started to put that together

❖ Roll Call Vote
1. P.S. 185 Name Change to The Locke School of Arts and Engineering
   The Roll Call Vote was called and passed unanimously by all Council members present (9 Y / 0 N / A).

❖ Adjournment 10:17P